

Deutscher Bundestag

Parliamentary Advisory Council on Sustainable Development

Rules of Procedure

for the parliamentary appraisal of the sustainability impact assessment in the framework of regulatory impact assessment

The decision to establish the Parliamentary Advisory Council on Sustainable Development (Parlamentarischer Beirat für nachhaltige Entwicklung – PBnE) of 20 February 2014 (Bundestag printed paper 18/559) once again tasked the PBnE with appraising whether the Federal Government adequately fulfils its obligation, stipulated in Rule 44 (1) in conjunction with Rule 62 of the Joint Rules of Procedure of the Federal Ministries (*Gemeinsame Geschäftsordnung der Bundesministerien* – GGO), to give an account of whether the impact of a project is in keeping with sustainable development ("sustainability impact assessment").

The PBnE submits the result of its appraisal to the respective lead committee of the German Bundestag in the form of an Expert Opinion for the latter to discuss and assess in writing.

Procedure:

The PBnE Secretariat enters the bills and ordinances of the Federal Government (projects) in the **Project List** immediately after their publication by the Bundesrat. This list is distributed to the members of the PBnE by electronic mail on Fridays.

The appraisal is performed by the competent rapporteurs of the parliamentary groups – one rapporteur from the coalition and one rapporteur from the opposition. In the event of projects having joint lead responsibility at the ministerial level, the rapporteurs agree among themselves on who is to perform the appraisal.

The appraisal is performed with the help of the 17 global Sustainable Development Goals enshrined in the 2030 Agenda, and the Management Rules and Indicators of the German Sustainable Development Strategy – 2016 version (Annex 1), although sustainability aspects going beyond these are also to be taken into consideration. The appraisal and the review result are to be documented, within 14 days and by mutual agreement, in a **Review Note** (Annex 2) that is to be submitted to the PBnE Secretariat by Monday evening at the latest for the next Advisory Council meeting.

The PBnE Secretariat documents the results of the Review Notes (votes) in a **Votes List**, which is submitted to the members of the PBnE by 12.00 noon on the Tuesday of weeks in which parliament sits, along with the Review Notes containing the vote "Request for examination". The Advisory Council decides on the Votes List at its next meeting.

Disputes regarding Review Notes should be settled between the rapporteurs – by calling in the PBnE spokespersons, if appropriate – prior to the aforementioned submission to the PBnE Secretariat. Postponement of the decision is to be avoided to ensure that the committees do not discuss projects for which there is no Expert Opinion from the PBnE.

As at: 9 March 2017 Page 1 of 2



Following adoption of the Votes List, the PBnE Secretariat promptly draws up an **Expert Opinion** on the basis of the Review Note and after consulting the rapporteurs. This document contains the result from the Review Note.

Depending on the vote of the rapporteurs, the further procedure is as follows:

1. For bills and ordinances discussed in the German Bundestag:

- a) In the case of **Expert Opinions with a request for examination**, the PBnE requests the lead committee to submit an enquiry to the Federal Ministry regarding the missing information on the sustainability impact, to include its deliberations on the subject in the committee's report, and to report back to the PBnE regarding the result of the deliberations. The lead Federal Ministry is notified of the actions of the PBnE.
- b) In the case of an **Expert Opinion without a request for examination**, the Expert Opinion is submitted to the lead committee, but without the lead Federal Ministry being notified.

All Expert Opinions should have been received by the respective lead committee by no later than the day of the first reading of the bill/ordinance in question. They are distributed as committee printed papers at that time. The committee's agenda indicates that the PBnE was "involved in an expert capacity".

2. For ordinances not discussed in the German Bundestag:

- a) In the case of **Expert Opinions with a request for examination**, the PBnE requests the lead Federal Ministry to send it a statement concerning the missing information regarding the sustainability impact.
- b) **Review Notes without a request for examination** are submitted neither to a committee, nor to a Federal Ministry, but are archived at the PBnE Secretariat, like all other proceedings.

In all cases, the PBnE Secretariat monitors the feedback reports from the committees and the Federal Ministries, enters them in the Projects List and informs the members of the Advisory Council.

Concluded proceedings are stored in the **Archive List**.

Annexes:

- SDGs, Management Rules, Sustainable Development Requirements and Indicators of the German Sustainable Development Strategy 2016 version (Bundestag printed paper 18/10910, p. 243 248)
- Review Note (the working version of which lists the Management Rules and Indicators)

SDGs, Management Rules, Sustainable Development Requirements and Indicators of the German Sustainable Development Strategy

Extract from the German Sustainable Development Strategy – 2016 version (Bundestag printed paper 18/10910, p. 243 – 248)

Management Rules for Sustainable Development

- Golden rules -
- (1) Each generation must solve its own problems itself without passing them on to the next generation. At the same time, it must make provision for foreseeable future problems.
- (2) In order to achieve intergenerational equity, social cohesion, quality of life and the assumption of international responsibility, as well as to realise human rights and preserve peaceful societies, it is essential to combine economic output, protection of the natural foundations of life and social responsibility in such a way that development is sustainable in the long term.
- (3) Shared responsibility for sustainable development requires the economic and societal fields and political stakeholders to be included appropriately in political decision-making processes.
- Rules of sustainable development for individual fields of action –
- (4) Renewable natural resources (such as forests or fish populations) may be exploited in the long term only within the scope of their ability to regenerate. Non-renewable natural resources (such as mineral raw materials or fossil fuels) may be exploited in the long term only to the extent that their functions cannot be replaced by other materials or other fuels. The release of substances may in the long term not be greater than the capacity for adaptation of natural systems e.g. the climate, the forests and the oceans.

- (5) Hazards and unjustifiable risks to human health are to be avoided.
- (6) The structural change triggered by technical developments and international competition must be structured to be economically successful, as well as ecologically and socially compatible. To this end, policy fields must be integrated in such a way that economic growth, high employment rates, social cohesion, the observation, protection and guaranteeing of human rights, and environmental protection go hand in hand.
- 7) Energy and resource consumption, as well as transport performance, must be decoupled from economic growth. At the same time, the aim must be for the growth-induced increase in demand for energy, resources and transport services to be more than outweighed by efficiency gains. A decisive role in this context is played by the creation of knowledge through research and development, together with the communication of knowledge through specific education measures.
- (8) The public-sector budgets are committed to intergenerational equity. This requires the Federation, the *Länder* and the municipalities to comply with the debt limits enshrined in the Basic Law. In a further step, the debt ratio must be steadily reduced to a level which ensures intergenerational equity.
- (9) Sustainable farming must be productive and competitive, and at the same time environmentally compatible, while also paying attention to the demands on welfare-oriented animal husbandry and preventive consumer protection, especially as regards health.

(10) In order to strengthen social cohesion and ensure no one is left behind,

- poverty and social exclusion are to be prevented to the greatest possible extent and inequality is to be reduced,
- all sections of society are to be given opportunities to participate in economic development,
- necessary adaptations to demographic change are to be implemented in good time in politics, the economy and society,
- participation in social and political life is to be open to all.

(11) In all decisions, the available scientific evidence and necessary research must be taken into account. The skills and competences required must be anchored in the education system in the sense of "Education for Sustainable Development".

(12) Our actions in Germany must take into consideration burdens they cause in other parts of the world. The general international conditions must be jointly structured in such a way that people in all countries can live their lives in human dignity, according to their own ideas and in harmony with their regional environment, and participate in economic developments. Environment and development form a single unit. Sustainable global action is geared to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development of the United Nations. In an integrated approach, the fight against poverty and hunger must be combined with

- the observation of human rights,
- economic development,
- protection of the environment, and
- responsible government action.

Sustainable development is measured in 36 areas using the following key indicators:

No.	Indicator areas Sustainable development	Indicators	Goals
	requirements		
SDG 1. E	and poverty in all its forms eve	rywhere	
1.1.a	Poverty Curbing poverty	Material deprivation	Keep the material deprivation rate significantly below the EU-28 level over the period to 2030.
1.1.b		Severe material deprivation	Keep the severe material deprivation rate significantly below the EU-28 level over the period to 2030.
SDG 2. E	End hunger, achieve food secur	ity and improved nutrition and	l promote sustainable agriculture
2.1.a	Farming Environmentally sound production in our cultivated landscapes	Nitrogen surplus	Reduce the overall nitrogen surplus in Germany to an average of 70 kilograms per hectare of agriculturally utilised land per year, 2028 – 2032
2.1.b		Organic farming	Increase the share of organic farming in the agriculturally utilised land area to 20 per cent in the coming years
SDG 3. E		te well-being for all at all ages	
3.1.a	Health and nutrition Living healthily longer	Premature mortality (deaths per 100,000 inhabitants under 70 years of age), women	Reduce to 100 cases per 100,000 inhabitants (women) by 2030
3.1.b		Premature mortality (deaths per 100,000 inhabitants under 70 years of age), men	Reduce to 190 cases per 100,000 inhabitants (men) by 2030
3.1.c		Smoking rate among young people (12 to 17 years of age)	Reduce to 7 per cent by 2030
3.1.d		Smoking rate among adults (15 years of age and older)	Reduce to 19 per cent by 2030

3.1.e		Obesity rate among young people (11 to 17 years of age)	Halt the rise permanently
3.1.f		Obesity rate among adults (18 years of age and older)	Halt the rise permanently
3.2.a	Air pollution Keeping the environment healthy	Air pollutant emissions (index of national emissions of the air pollutants SO ₂ , NO _x , NH ₃ , NMVOCs and PM _{2.5})	Reduce emissions to 55 per cent of their 2005 levels (unweighted mean of the five pollutants) by 2030
3.2.b		Proportion of the population with heightened PM ₁₀ exposure in Germany	Meet the WHO particulate matter recommendation of an annual mean concentration of 20 micrograms per cubic metre for PM ₁₀ nationwide if possible by 2030
SDG 4.	Ensure inclusive and equitable	quality education and promote	e lifelong learning opportunities for all
4.1.a	Education Continuously improving education and vocational training	Early school-leavers (18- to 24-year-olds without a school-leaving certificate)	Reduce the proportion to below 10 per cent by 2020
4.1.b		30- to 34-year-olds with a tertiary or post-secondary qualification	Increase the proportion to 42 per cent by 2020
4.2.a	Prospects for families Improving the compatibility of work and family life	All-day care provision for children (0 to 2 years of age)	Increase to 35 per cent by 2030
4.2.b		All-day care provision for children (3 to 5 years of age)	Increase to 60 per cent by 2020 and 70 per cent by 2030
SDG 5.	Achieve gender equality and en		
5.1.a	Equal opportunities Promoting equal opportunities in society	Gender pay gap	Reduce the gap to 10 per cent by 2020 Maintain this over the period to 2030
5.1.b		Women in executive positions in the business sector	Ensure women hold 30 per cent of the seats on the supervisory boards of listed companies with full co-determination by 2030
5.1.c	Boosting the economic empowerment of women globally	Vocational training for women and girls via German development cooperation	Increase gradually by a third compared to the 2015 level by 2030
SDG 6.	Ensure availability and sustain	L	sanitation for all
6.1.a	Water quality Reducing water pollution	Total phosphate in watercourses	Meet or go below the reference values for the respective type of water at all monitoring stations by 2030
6.1.b		Nitrate in groundwater – proportion of monitoring stations in Germany where the 50 mg/l limit is exceeded	Meet the "50 mg/l" limit for nitrate in groundwater by 2030
6.2	Drinking water and sanitation Better access to drinking water and sanitation worldwide, higher (safe) quality	Number of people who gain access to drinking water and sanitation as a result of German support	By 2030, 10 million people are to gain access to water per year
SDG 7.	Ensure access to affordable, rel	iable, sustainable and modern	energy for all
7.1.a	Resource conservation Using resources economically and efficiently	Final energy productivity	Increase final energy productivity by 2.1 per cent per year over the period from 2008 to 2050
7.1.b		Primary energy consumption	Reduce by 20 per cent by 2020 and 50 per cent by 2050, compared to 2008

= 0	D 11		1 1 10 11 2000 00
7.2.a	Renewable energy	Share of renewable energy	Increase to 18 per cent by 2020, 30 per
	Strengthening a sustainable	in gross final energy	cent by 2030 and 60 per cent by 2050
	energy supply	consumption	
7.2.b		Share of electricity from	Increase to at least 35 per cent by 2020,
		renewable energy sources	at least 50 per cent by 2030, at least 65
		in gross electricity	per cent by 2040 and at least 80 per cent
		consumption	by 2050
	Promote sustained, inclusive an vork for all	nd sustainable economic growt	h, full and productive employment and
8.1	Resource conservation	Total raw material	Maintain the 2000 – 2010 trend over the
	Using resources	productivity: (GDP +	period to 2030
	economically and	imports)/Raw Material	
	efficiently	Input (RMI)	
8.2.a	Government debt	Government deficit	Annual government deficit below 3 per
	Consolidating the public		cent of GDP
	finances – Creating		Maintain this over the period to 2030
	intergenerational equity		
8.2.b		Structural deficit	Structurally balanced government
			budget, federal structural deficit of no
			more than 0.5 per cent of GDP
			Maintain this over the period to 2030
8.2.c		General government debt	Debt-to-GDP ratio no more than 60 per
			cent of GDP
			Maintain this level over the period to
			2030
8.3	Provision for future	Gross fixed capital	Appropriate trend for this ratio
	economic stability	formation in relation to	Maintain this over the period to 2030
	Creating favourable	GDP	1
	investment conditions –		
	Securing long-term		
	prosperity		
8.4	Economic output	GDP per capita	Steady and appropriate economic growth
	Combining greater		
	economic output with		
	environmental and social		
	responsibility		
8.5.a	Employment	Employment rate, total	Increase to 78 per cent by 2030
	Boosting employment levels	(20 to 64 years of age)	
8.5.b		Employment rate, older	Increase to 60 per cent by 2030
		population (60 to 64 years	
		of age)	
8.6	Global supply chains	Number of members of the	Increase significantly by 2030
	Facilitating decent work	Partnership for Sustainable	
	worldwide	Textiles	
SDG 9. E	Build resilient infrastructure, p	romote inclusive and sustainal	ble industrialisation and foster innovation
9.1	Innovation	Private and public spending	At least 3 per cent of GDP per year by
	Shaping the future with	on research and	2030
	new solutions	development	
SDG 10.	Reduce inequality within and		
10.1	Equal educational	Foreign school-leavers	Increase the proportion of foreign school-
	opportunities		leavers with at least a lower secondary
	Educational attainment at		(Hauptschule) school-leaving certificate
	school level of foreign		and align it with the share of German
	nationals in Germany		school-leavers by 2030
10.2	Equity	GINI coefficient for incomes	Ensure the GINI coefficient for incomes
	Preventing excessive	after social transfers	after social transfers is below the EU-28
			level by 2030
	THEOLOGICA WILLIAM GERMAN	1	
	inequality within Germany		
SDG 11.	Make cities and human settlen	nents inclusive, safe, resilient a	and sustainable
SDG 11. 11.1.a		nents inclusive, safe, resilient a Expansion in the land used	and sustainable Reduce daily growth to 30 hectares
	Make cities and human settlen		

11.1.b		Loss of open space in m ² per capita	Reduce the loss of open space per capita
11.1.c		Number of inhabitants in relation to the land used for human settlements and transport infrastructure (settlement density)	No reduction in settlement density
11.2.a	Mobility Guaranteeing mobility – Protecting the environment	Final energy consumption in goods transport	Target range of minus 15 to minus 20 per cent by 2030
11.2.b		Final energy consumption in passenger transport	Target range of minus 15 to minus 20 per cent by 2030
11.2.c		Population-weighted average public transport journey time from each stop to the next regional/higher- order centre	Reduction
11.3	Housing	Financial overstretch due to	Reduce the share of the population
	Affordable housing for all	the cost of housing	affected to 13 per cent by 2030
	Ensure sustainable consumption		
12.1.a	Sustainable consumption Shaping consumption in an environmentally and socially compatible way	Market share of products with government ecolabels (looking to the future: market share of products and services with credible and demanding ecolabels and social labels)	34 per cent by 2030
12.1.b		Energy consumption and CO ₂ emissions from consumption	Continuously reduce energy consumption
12.2	Sustainable production Steadily increasing the proportion of production which is sustainable	EMAS eco-management scheme	5000 sites by 2030
SDG 13.	Take urgent action to combat o	climate change and its impacts	
13.1.a	Climate protection Reducing greenhouse gases	Greenhouse gas emissions	Reduce by at least 40 per cent by 2020, at least 55 per cent by 2030, at least 70 per cent by 2040 and by 80 to 95 per cent by 2050, compared to 1990 levels
13.1.b	German contribution to international climate finance	International climate finance for greenhouse gas reduction and climate change adaptation	Double financing by 2020 compared to 2014 levels
SDG 14.			sources for sustainable development
14.1.aa	Marine conservation Protecting seas and marine resources and using them sustainably	Nutrient inputs in coastal and marine waters – nitrogen input via the rivers which flow into the Baltic Sea	Achieve "good" status under the Surface Waters Ordinance (Oberflächengewässerverordnung) (mean annual values of total nitrogen for rivers which flow into the Baltic Sea are not to exceed 2.6 milligrams per litre)
14.1.ab		Nutrient inputs in coastal and marine waters – nitrogen input via the rivers which flow into the North Sea	Achieve "good" status under the Surface Waters Ordinance (mean annual values of total nitrogen for rivers which flow into the North Sea are not to exceed 2.8 milligrams per litre)
14.1.b		Proportion of North Sea and Baltic Sea fish stocks which are sustainably fished	Goal for 2030: EU requirements
		verse land degradation and ha	osystems, sustainably manage forests, lt biodiversity loss
15.1	Species diversity	Species diversity and	Increase to an index value of 100 by 2030

15.2	Ecosystems	Eutrophication of	Reduce by 35 per cent compared to 2005
	Protecting ecosystems,	ecosystems	by 2030
	preserving ecosystem		
	services, conserving		
	habitats		
15.3	Forests	Payments to developing	Increase by 2030
	Avoiding deforestation	countries for the verified	
		conservation or re-	
		establishment of forests	
		under the REDD+ rules	
	Promote peaceful and inclusived effective, accountable and in		elopment, provide access to justice for all s
16.1	Crime	Criminal offences	Reduce the number of criminal offences
	Further increasing personal		recorded per 100,000 inhabitants to
	security		below 7000 by 2030
16.2	Peace and security	Number of projects to	At least 15 projects per year over the
	Taking practical steps to	secure, register and destroy	period to 2030
	combat proliferation,	small arms and light	
	especially of small arms	weapons run by Germany	
		in affected regions of the	
		world	
16.3.a	Good governance	Corruption Perception	Improve by 2030
	Combating corruption	Index in Germany	
16.3.b		Corruption Perception	Improve by 2030
		Index in the partner	
		countries in German	
		development cooperation	
SDG 17. developi		mentation and revitalise the g	lobal partnership for sustainable
17.1	Development cooperation	Share of expenditure for	Increase to 0.7 per cent of gross national
	Supporting sustainable	official development	income by 2030
	development	assistance in gross national	
	-	income	
17.2	Knowledge transfer,	Number of students and	Increase by 10 per cent by 2020, and
	particularly in the	researchers from	subsequently maintain this level
	technical field	developing countries and	
	Imparting knowledge	from LDCs per year (or	
	internationally	semester)	
17.3	Opening markets	Proportion of total German	Increase the proportion by 100 per cent
	Improving trade	imports which come from	by 2030 (compared to 2014)
	opportunities for	LDCs	
	developing countries		

Appraisal of Sustainability Impact Assessment Review Note

Bundesrat printed paper no.: XXX/XX

Bundestag printed paper no.: XX/XXXX

Government parliamentary group	Opposition parliamentary group	
CDU / CSU or SPD	The Left Party or Alliance 90/The Greens	
(Name) Member of the Bundestag	(Name) Member of the Bundestag	
Contact	Contact	
(Name)	(Name)	
(Extension)	(Extension)	
(Email)	(Email)	

URGENT-Bundesrat deadline: XX.XX.XXXX (DELETE IF APPROPRIATE)

Title Enter the title of the law / law approving an international agreement / on nance here (copy and paste).	
Lead ministry	Federal Ministry XXX
Status	Enter the date on the printed paper here. If the project is already on the agenda in the Bundesrat or the Bundestag, for example, or if the Bundesrat has already recommended its referral to a committee, etc., please note this here.

REVIEW RESULT	Coalition parliamentary group	Opposition parliamentary group
Recommenda- tion	Select one of the following: o Request for examination to lead committee o Letter to lead ministry o No request for examination	Select one of the following: o Request for examination to lead committee o Letter to lead ministry o No request for examination
Reasons	 Letter to lead ministry No request for examination Briefly outline the reasons for or against a request for examination here. Examples: The account given of the sustainability impact assessment is plausible. The account given of the sustainability impact assessment may not be plausible, but the project nevertheless has a positive impact on sustainable development. The account given of the sustainability impact assessment is implausible. It contains no statements (particularly) regarding the Management Rules and/or Indicators mentioned below. The matter relates to a law approving an international agreement. Even laws of this kind can contain provisions affecting sustainable development. They, too, are subject to the provisions on regulatory impact assessment, i.e. Rule 44 (1) of the Joint Rules of Procedure of the Federal Ministries. Should it not be possible to reach an agreement, please call in the spokespersons without delay. If it is then still not possible to reach an agreement, please enter the differing reasons here, one below the other, so that the note can be discussed at the Advisory Council meeting. CDU/CSU – SPD: XXX The Left Party – Alliance 90/The Greens: XXX 	
Processing date	XX.XX.201X	XX.XX.201X

Bundesrat printed paper no.: XXX/XX

Bundestag printed paper no.: XX/XXXX

2 0 1 0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
Appraisal of Sustainability Impact Assessment	
Review Note	

TEXT REVIEW	Coalition parliamentary group	Opposition parliamentary group	
	Yes / No / Limited (or similar)	Yes / No / Limited (or similar)	
Link to the German Sustainable Develop- ment Strategy accord- ing to the rapporteurs	list on pages 3 to 9, including the sustainable development in the op In addition, please also list further	pinion of the two rapporteurs. It aspects of the Sustainable Develop- gement Rules and Indicators are not an aid.	
	Indicators: X; X; X		
What statements on sustainable development are made in the law / law approving an international agreement / ordinance?	Please insert the statement from the project, which can be found <u>under</u> the corresponding heading in the Explanatory Memorandum in the law / law approving an international agreement / ordinance.		
Is this statement plausible?	Yes / No	Yes / No	
If the statement is plausible, you need not complete the next three fields. Otherwise, only indicate the numbers missing from the point of view of the rapporteurs and/or indicate, where appropriate, what statement is additionally missing or would be desirable. Again, the rapporteurs must agree. If not, see above.			
Management Rules which have not been considered			
Indicators which have not been considered			
What further state- ments regarding the national impact on sustainable develop- ment are missing?			

Statement of facts (brief summary taken from the project):

Here, you should copy and paste a brief summary of the project from the law / law approving an international agreement / ordinance (e.g. from the covering note or the Explanatory Memorandum). It is important that third parties also understand what will change as a result of the project, so that they can see whether it will have an impact on the Sustainable Development Strategy or other long-term consequences pursuant to Rule 44 (1) of the Joint Rules of Procedure of the Federal Ministries.

Parliamentary Advisory Council on Sustainable Development (PBnE) Appraisal of Sustainability Impact Assessment Review Note Bundesrat printed paper no.: XXX/XX

Parliamentary Advisory Council on Sustainable Development (PBnE) Appraisal of Sustainability Impact Assessment Review Note Bundesrat printed paper no.: XXX/XX

Bundestag printed paper no.: XX/XXXX

Please delete these pages before submitting the Review Note.

Title of the Management Rules and Indicators for copying:

Management Rules of the German Sustainable Development Strategy

Management Rule (1) Each generation must solve its own problems itself without passing them on to the next generation. At the same time, it must make provision for foreseeable future problems.

Management Rule (2) In order to achieve intergenerational equity, social cohesion, quality of life and the assumption of international responsibility, as well as to realise human rights and preserve peaceful societies, it is essential to combine economic output, protection of the natural foundations of life and social responsibility in such a way that development is sustainable in the long term.

Management Rule (3) Shared responsibility for sustainable development requires the economic and societal fields and political stakeholders to be included appropriately in political decision-making processes.

Management Rule (4) Renewable natural resources (such as forests or fish populations) may be exploited in the long term only within the scope of their ability to regenerate. Non-renewable natural resources (such as mineral raw materials or fossil fuels) may be exploited in the long term only to the extent that their functions cannot be replaced by other materials or other fuels. The release of substances may in the long term not be greater than the capacity for adaptation of natural systems – e.g. the climate, the forests and the oceans.

Management Rule (5) Hazards and unjustifiable risks to human health are to be avoided.

Management Rule (6) The structural change triggered by technical developments and international competition must be structured to be economically successful, as well as ecologically and socially compatible. To this end, policy fields must be integrated in such a way that economic growth, high employment rates, social cohesion, the observation, protection and guaranteeing of human rights, and environmental protection go hand in hand.

Management Rule (7) Energy and resource consumption, as well as transport performance, must be decoupled from economic growth. At the same time, the aim must be for the growth-induced increase in demand for energy, resources and transport services to be more than outweighed by efficiency gains. A decisive role in this context is played by the creation of knowledge through research and development, together with the communication of knowledge through specific education measures.

Management Rule (8) The public-sector budgets are committed to intergenerational equity. This

Bundestag printed paper no.: XX/XXXX

requires the Federation, the *Länder* and the municipalities to comply with the debt limits enshrined in the Basic Law. In a further step, the debt ratio must be steadily reduced to a level which ensures intergenerational equity.

Management Rule (9) Sustainable farming must be productive and competitive, and at the same time environmentally compatible, while also paying attention to the demands on welfare-oriented animal husbandry and preventive consumer protection, especially as regards health.

Management Rule (10) In order to strengthen social cohesion and ensure no one is left behind,

- poverty and social exclusion are to be prevented to the greatest possible extent and inequality is to be reduced,
- all sections of society are to be given opportunities to participate in economic development,
- necessary adaptations to demographic change are to be implemented in good time in politics, the economy and society,
- participation in social and political life is to be open to all.

Management Rule (11) In all decisions, the available scientific evidence and necessary research must be taken into account. The skills and competences required must be anchored in the education system in the sense of "Education for Sustainable Development".

Management Rule (12) Our actions in Germany must take into consideration burdens they cause in other parts of the world. The general international conditions must be jointly structured in such a way that people in all countries can live their lives in human dignity, according to their own ideas and in harmony with their regional environment, and participate in economic developments. Environment and development form a single unit. Sustainable global action is geared to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development of the United Nations. In an integrated approach, the fight against poverty and hunger must be combined with

- the observation of human rights,
- economic development,
- protection of the environment, and
- responsible government action.

Bundestag printed paper no.: XX/XXXX

Appraisal of Sustainability Impact Assessment Review Note

SDGs, Sustainable Development Requirements and Indicators of the German Sustainable Development Strategy

SDG 1. End poverty in all its forms everywhere

- **1.1 Poverty:** Curbing poverty
 - **1.1.a** Material deprivation
 - 1.1.b Severe material deprivation

SDG 2. End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture

- **2.1 Farming:** Environmentally sound production in our cultivated landscapes
 - **2.1.a** Nitrogen surplus
 - **2.1.b** Organic farming

SDG 3. Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages

- **3.1 Health and nutrition:** Living healthily longer
 - **3.1.a** Premature mortality (deaths per 100,000 inhabitants under 70 years of age), women
 - ${\bf 3.1.b}$ Premature mortality (deaths per 100,000 inhabitants under 70 years of age), men
 - **3.1.c** Smoking rate among young people (12 to 17 years of age)
 - **3.1.d** Smoking rate among adults (15 years of age and older)
 - **3.1.e** Obesity rate among young people (11 to 17 years of age)
 - **3.1.f** Obesity rate among adults (18 years of age and older)
- **3.2 Air pollution:** *Keeping the environment healthy*
 - **3.2.a** Air pollutant emissions (index of national emissions of the air pollutants SO_2 , NO_x , NH_3 , NMVOCs and $PM_{2.5}$)
 - **3.2.b** Proportion of the population with heightened PM₁₀ exposure in Germany

SDG 4. Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

- 4.1 Education: Continuously improving education and vocational training
 - **4.1.a** Early school-leavers (18- to 24-year-olds without a school-leaving certificate)
 - **4.1.b** 30- to 34-year-olds with a tertiary or post-secondary qualification
- **4.2 Prospects for families:** *Improving the compatibility of work and family life*
 - **4.2.a** All-day care provision for children (0 to 2 years of age)
 - **4.2.b** All-day care provision for children (3 to 5 years of age)

Bundestag printed paper no.: XX/XXXX

SDG 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls

- **5.1. Equal opportunities:** Promoting equal opportunities in society
 - **5.1.a** Gender pay gap
 - **5.1.b** Women in executive positions in the business sector
- **5.1.c Equal opportunities:** Boosting the economic empowerment of women globally
 - **5.1.c** Vocational training for women and girls via German development cooperation

SDG 6. Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all

- **6.1 Water quality:** Reducing water pollution
 - **6.1.a** Total phosphate in watercourses
 - ${\bf 6.1.b}$ Nitrate in groundwater proportion of monitoring stations in Germany where the 50 mg/l limit is exceeded
- **6.2 Drinking water and sanitation:** Better access to drinking water and sanitation worldwide, higher (safe) quality
 - **6.2** Number of people who gain access to drinking water and sanitation as a result of German support

SDG 7. Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all

- **7.1 Resource conservation:** Using resources economically and efficiently
 - **7.1.a** Final energy productivity
 - **7.1.b** Primary energy consumption
- **7.2 Renewable energy:** Strengthening a sustainable energy supply
 - **7.2.a** Share of renewable energy in gross final energy consumption
 - 7.2.b Share of electricity from renewable energy sources in gross electricity consumption
- SDG 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all
 - **8.1 Resource conservation:** *Using resources economically and efficiently*
 - **8.1.a** Total raw material productivity: (GDP + imports)/Raw Material Input (RMI)
 - **8.2 Government debt:** Consolidating the public finances Creating intergenerational equity
 - 8.2.a Government deficit
 - 8.2.b Structural deficit
 - 8.2.c General government debt

- **8.3 Provision for future economic stability:** Creating favourable investment conditions Securing long-term prosperity
 - **8.3.** Gross fixed capital formation in relation to GDP
- **8.4 Economic output:** Combining greater economic output with environmental and social responsibility
 - 8.4. GDP per capita
- 8.5 Employment: Boosting employment levels
 - **8.5.a** Employment rate, total (20 to 64 years of age)
 - 8.5.b Employment rate, older population (60 to 64 years of age)
- 8.6 Global supply chains: Facilitating decent work worldwide
 - 8.6 Number of members of the Partnership for Sustainable Textiles
- <u>SDG 9. Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialisation and foster innovation</u>
 - **9.1 Innovation:** Shaping the future with new solutions
 - 9.1 Private and public spending on research and development
- SDG 10. Reduce inequality within and among countries
 - **10.1 Equal educational opportunities:** Educational attainment at school level of foreign nationals in Germany
 - 10.1 Foreign school-leavers
 - 10.2 Equity: Preventing excessive inequality within Germany
 - 10.2 GINI coefficient for incomes after social transfers
- SDG 11. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable
 - 11.1 Land use: Sustainable land use
 - **11.1.a** Expansion in the land used for human settlements and transport infrastructure
 - 11.1.b Loss of open space in m² per capita
 - **11.1.c** Number of inhabitants in relation to the land used for human settlements and transport infrastructure (settlement density)
 - **11.2 Mobility:** Guaranteeing mobility Protecting the environment
 - 11.2.a Final energy consumption in goods transport
 - 11.2.b Final energy consumption in passenger transport
 - **11.2.c** Population-weighted average public transport journey time from each stop to the next regional/higher-order centre

- **11.3 Housing:** Affordable housing for all
 - **11.3** Financial overstretch due to the cost of housing
- SDG 12. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns
 - **12.1 Sustainable consumption:** Shaping consumption in an environmentally and socially compatible way
 - **12.1.a** Market share of products with government ecolabels (looking to the future: market share of products and services with credible and demanding ecolabels and social labels)
 - 12.1.b Energy consumption and CO₂ emissions from consumption
 - **12.2 Sustainable production:** *Steadily increasing the proportion of production which is sustainable*
 - 12.2 EMAS eco-management scheme
- SDG 13. Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts
 - **13.1 Climate protection:** Reducing greenhouse gases
 - 13.1.a Greenhouse gas emissions
 - 13.1.b Climate protection: German contribution to international climate finance
 - **13.1.b** International climate finance for greenhouse gas reduction and climate change adaptation
- SDG 14. Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development
 - **14.1 Marine conservation:** Protecting seas and marine resources and using them sustainably
 - **14.1.aa** Nutrient inputs in coastal and marine waters nitrogen input via the rivers which flow into the Baltic Sea
 - **14.1.ab** Nutrient inputs in coastal and marine waters nitrogen input via the rivers which flow into the North Sea
 - **14.1.b** Proportion of North Sea and Baltic Sea fish stocks which are sustainably fished
- <u>SDG 15. Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss</u>
 - **15.1 Species diversity:** Conserving species Protecting habitats
 - **15.1** Species diversity and landscape quality
 - 15.2 Ecosystems: Protecting ecosystems, preserving ecosystem services, conserving habitats
 - 15.2 Eutrophication of ecosystems

Bundesrat printed paper no.: XXX/XX

- **15.3 Forests:** Avoiding deforestation
 - **15.3** Payments to developing countries for the verified conservation or re-establishment of forests under the REDD+ rules
- SDG 16. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
 - **16.1 Crime:** Further increasing personal security
 - **16.1** Criminal offences
 - **16.2 Peace and security:** Taking practical steps to combat proliferation, especially of small arms
 - **16.2** Number of projects to secure, register and destroy small arms and light weapons run by Germany in affected regions of the world
 - **16.3 Good governance:** Combating corruption
 - 16.3.a Corruption Perception Index in Germany
 - **16.3.b** Corruption Perception Index in the partner countries in German development cooperation
- SDG 17. Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalise the global partnership for sustainable development
 - 17.1 Development cooperation: Supporting sustainable development
 - **17.1** Share of expenditure for official development assistance in gross national income
 - 17.2 Knowledge transfer, particularly in the technical field: Imparting knowledge internationally
 - **17.2** Number of students and researchers from developing countries and from LDCs per year (or semester)
 - **17.3 Opening markets:** *Improving trade opportunities for developing countries*
 - 17.3 Proportion of total German imports which come from LDCs