



Rules of Procedure

for the parliamentary appraisal of the sustainability impact assessment in the framework of regulatory impact assessment

The decision to establish the Parliamentary Advisory Council on Sustainable Development (Parlamentarischer Beirat für nachhaltige Entwicklung – PBnE) of 25 April 2018 (Bundestag printed paper 19/1837) tasked the PBnE with appraising whether the Federal Government adequately fulfils its obligation, stipulated in Rule 44 (1) in conjunction with Rule 62 of the Joint Rules of Procedure of the Federal Ministries (*Gemeinsame Geschäftsordnung der Bundesministerien* – GGO), to give an account of whether the impact of a project is in keeping with sustainable development (“sustainability impact assessment”).

The PBnE submits the result of its appraisal to the German Bundestag’s lead committee for the project in the form of an Expert Opinion, which the latter incorporates in its report.

Procedure:

The PBnE Secretariat enters the bills and ordinances of the Federal Government (projects) in the **Project List** immediately after their publication by the Bundesrat. This list is distributed to the members of the PBnE by electronic mail on Fridays.

The appraisal is performed by the competent rapporteurs of the parliamentary groups – one rapporteur from the coalition and one rapporteur from the opposition. In the event of projects having joint lead responsibility at the ministerial level, the rapporteurs agree among themselves on who is to perform the appraisal.

The appraisal is performed with the help of the 17 global Sustainable Development Goals enshrined in the 2030 Agenda, and the Principles of sustainable development and Indicators of the German Sustainable Development Strategy – 2018 Update (Annex 1), although sustainability aspects going beyond these can also be taken into consideration. The appraisal and the review result are to be documented, within 14 days and by mutual agreement, in a **Review Note** (Annex 2) that is to be submitted to the PBnE Secretariat by Monday evening at the latest for the next Advisory Council meeting.

The PBnE Secretariat documents the results of the Review Notes (votes) in a **Votes List**, which is submitted to the members of the PBnE by 12.00 noon on the Tuesday of weeks in which Parliament sits, along with the Review Notes containing the vote “Request for examination”. The Advisory Council decides on the Votes List at its next meeting.

Disputes regarding Review Notes should be settled between the rapporteurs – by calling in the PBnE spokespersons, if appropriate – prior to the aforementioned submission to the PBnE Secretariat. Postponement of the decision is to be avoided to ensure that the committees do not discuss projects for which there is no Expert Opinion from the PBnE.



Following adoption of the Votes List, the PBnE Secretariat promptly draws up an **Expert Opinion** on the basis of the Review Note and after consulting the rapporteurs. This document contains the result from the Review Note.

Depending on the vote of the rapporteurs, the further procedure is as follows:

1. In the case of **Expert Opinions with a request for examination**, the PBnE submits an enquiry to the lead Federal Ministry regarding the missing information on the sustainability impact, and notifies the lead committee. The PBnE also asks the committee to include the request for examination and the Federal Ministry's response in the committee's report.
2. In the case of an **Expert Opinion without a request for examination**, the Expert Opinion is submitted to the lead committee, but without the lead Federal Ministry being notified.

All Expert Opinions should be received by the respective lead committee no later than the day of the first reading of the bill/ordinance in question. They are distributed as committee printed papers. The committee's agenda indicates that the PBnE was "involved in an expert capacity".

Concluded proceedings are stored in the **Archive List**.

Annexes:

- 1) SDGs, Principles of sustainable development, Sustainable Development Requirements and Indicators of the German Sustainable Development Strategy – 2018 Update
- 2) Review Note (the working version of which lists the Principles of sustainable development and Indicators)

SDGs, Principles of sustainable development, Sustainable Development Requirements and Indicators

of the German Sustainable Development Strategy

Extract from the German Sustainable Development Strategy – 2018 Update
(Bundestag printed paper 19/5700, p. 51 - 57)

1. Principles of sustainable development

The following principles contain fundamental requirements for sustainable policy. They are intended to help put the guiding principle of sustainable development into practice and are based on the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development in light of the urgent necessity to transform our society and economy.

(1.) Apply sustainable development as a guiding principle at all times and in all areas

The overriding goal and benchmark of all action is to safeguard the Earth's natural resources on a permanent basis and to enable all people to live a life in dignity now and in the future.*

To this end, economic efficiency, the protection of natural resources, social justice and equal participation must be synthesised in all decisions, while accounting for systemic interrelationships and technological and societal innovations, so that developments for present and future generations are environmentally and socially sustainable on a global scale. Political action must be coherent.

(2.) Assume global responsibility

- a) In line with the United Nations' 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the Paris Climate Agreement, the following must be combined at global level:
 - The fight against poverty, hunger, social inequality and exclusion
 - Respecting, protecting and guaranteeing human rights
 - Comprehensive participation for all in economic and social development
 - Protection of the environment, especially the climate, including compliance with environmental boundaries in a regional and global context
 - Responsible government action under the rule of law
- b) Germany must consider and encourage sustainable development in other countries. Wherever possible, our actions in Germany must not cause burdens for people or the environment in other countries.

* World Commission on Environment and Development (Brundtland Commission), 1987

(3.) Strengthen the natural resource base on which life depends

- a) To strengthen the natural resource base and keep within planetary boundaries, material cycles must be closed as quickly as possible and/or brought into alignment with ecosystem processes and functions. To this end,
 - Renewable natural goods (e.g. woods and fish populations) and soils may be used only within the bounds of their ability to regenerate and without impairing their other environmental functions;
 - Non-renewable natural goods (e.g. mineral raw materials and fossil fuels) must be used as sparingly as possible. Renewable resources are to replace the use of non-renewable resources, provided this reduces the environmental impact and this use is also sustainable in every aspect; and
 - Substances may be released into the environment only in line with the precautionary principle and within the environmental boundaries of the sustainability of natural systems (environmental responsiveness).
- b) Dangers and unjustifiable risks to human health and nature must be avoided.

(4.) Strengthen sustainable economic activity

- a) The structural transformation required for global sustainable consumption and production and the technological advancements to be developed for this purpose must be economically successful as well as ecologically and socially sustainable and ensure intergenerational equity in the German and global contexts.
- b) Energy and natural resource consumption and the provision of transport services must be decoupled from economic growth. At the same time, the aim must be for the increase in demand for energy, resources and transport to be reduced and for consumption to decline as a result of efficiency gains (absolute decoupling).
- c) Sustainable agriculture and fishing must be productive, competitive and compatible with society and the environment; they must protect and conserve biodiversity, soils and waters in particular and take into account the requirements of livestock farming in a way that is fair to the animals and safeguards consumer protection, particularly concerning health matters.
- d) Public budgets are obliged to take account of intergenerational equity in all dimensions of sustainability. The financial markets must consider the requirements of sustainable development.

(5.) Preserve and enhance social cohesion in an open society

In order to strengthen social cohesion and leave no one behind,

- Poverty and social exclusion must be overcome and prevented to the greatest possible extent and inclusive prosperity promoted;
- Equal living standards must be sought in every region;
- Everyone must have an equal opportunity to share in economic development;
- Necessary adaptations to demographic change must be implemented at an early stage at the political and economic level and in society;
- Everyone must be able to fully take part in social, cultural and political life without discrimination; and
- Contributions must be made to reduce poverty and inequality worldwide.

(6.) Use education, science and research, and innovation as drivers of sustainable development

- a) The necessary qualifications and skills must be enshrined throughout the education system in order to create “education for sustainable development”.

Opportunities to share in high-quality education and acquire skills for sustainable development must be further improved regardless of background, gender or age.

- b) All decisions must be based on research findings. Science and research are called upon to focus more intensively on the goals and challenges of global sustainable development.
- c) Sustainability aspects must be included in innovation processes in a consistent manner from the start, especially in the context of digitisation, so that opportunities for sustainable development can be seized and risks for people and the environment can be avoided. At the same time, innovativeness and its scope must be increased.

2. Sustainable development is measured in 38 areas using the following key indicators:

No.	Indicator field <i>Sustainability postulate</i>	Indicators	Targets
SDG 1. End poverty in all its forms everywhere			
1.1.a	Poverty <i>Reducing poverty</i>	Material deprivation	Keeping the proportion of people who are materially deprived significantly below the EU-28 level by 2030
1.1.b		Severe material deprivation	Keeping the proportion of people suffering from severe material deprivation significantly below the EU-28 level by 2030
SDG 2. End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture			
2.1.a	Farming <i>Environmentally sound production in our cultivated landscapes</i>	Nitrogen surplus	Overall nitrogen surpluses for Germany to be reduced to 70 kilograms per hectare of utilised agricultural land in the annual average from 2028–2032
2.1.b		Organic farming	Share of organic farming on land used for agriculture to be increased to 20 % by 2030
2.2	Food security <i>Realising the right to food worldwide</i>	Support of good governance	Funds disbursed for the application of guidelines and recommendations of the UN Committee on World Food Security (CFS) as a percentage of total spending for food security to be increased appropriately by 2030
SDG 3. Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages			
3.1.a	Health and nutrition <i>Living healthy longer</i>	Premature mortality (Cases of death per 100,000 residents under 70): women	To be reduced to 100 per 100,000 residents (women) by 2030
3.1.b		Premature mortality (Cases of death per 100,000 residents under 70): men	To be reduced to 190 per 100,000 residents (men) by 2030
3.1.c		Smoking rate among young people (12- to 17-year-olds)	To be reduced to 7 % by 2030
3.1.d		Smoking rate among adults (15 years and older)	To be reduced to 19 % by 2030
3.1.e		Obesity rate among young people (11- to 17-year-olds)	Increase to be permanently halted
3.1.f		Obesity rate among adults (18 years and older)	Increase to be permanently halted
3.2.a	Air pollution <i>Keeping the environment healthy</i>	Emissions of air pollutants (index of national emissions of air pollutants SO ₂ , NO _x , NH ₃ , NMVOC and PM _{2.5})	2005 emissions to be reduced to 55 % (unweighted average of the five pollutants) by 2030
3.2.b		Share of the population with increased exposure to PM ₁₀ in Germany	WHO particulate matter benchmark of an annual average of 20 micrograms/cubic metre for PM ₁₀ to be achieved as widely as possible by 2030

No.	Indicator field <i>Sustainability postulate</i>	Indicators	Targets
SDG 4. Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all			
4.1.a	Education and training <i>Continuously improving education and vocational training</i>	Early school leavers (18- to 24-year-olds without a school leaving certificate)	To be reduced to less than 10 % by 2020
4.1.b		30- to 34-year-olds with a tertiary or post-secondary non-tertiary level of education	To be increased to 42 % by 2020
4.2.a	Prospects for families <i>Improving the compatibility of work and family life</i>	All-day care provision for children (0- to 2-year-olds)	To be increased to 35 % by 2030
4.2.b		All-day care provision for children (3- to 5-year-olds)	To be increased to 60 % by 2020 and 70 % by 2030
SDG 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls			
5.1.a	Equal opportunities <i>Promoting equal opportunities in society</i>	Gender pay gap	To be reduced to 10 % by 2020, maintained until 2030
5.1.b		Women in management positions in business	30 % women in supervisory boards of listed and fully co-determined companies by 2030
5.1.c	<i>Strengthening the economic participation of women globally</i>	Vocational qualification of women and girls through German development cooperation	To be successively increased by a third by 2030 compared to 2015 as the base year
SDG 6. Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all			
6.1.a	Water quality <i>Reducing the pollution of water with substances</i>	Phosphorous in flowing waters	The benchmark values for specific types of water to be met or beaten at all monitoring points by 2030
6.1.b		Nitrate in groundwater – proportion of monitoring points in Germany at which the threshold of 50 mg/l for nitrate is exceeded	“50 mg/l” of nitrate in groundwater to be complied with by 2030
6.2	Clean water and sanitation <i>Better access to drinking water and sanitation worldwide, higher (safer) quality</i>	Number of people gaining access to drinking water and sanitation through support from Germany	10 million people a year to gain access to water by 2030
SDG 7. Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all			
7.1.a	Resource conservation <i>Using resources economically and efficiently</i>	Final energy productivity	Final energy productivity to be increased by 2.1 % per year from 2008 to 2050
7.1.b		Primary energy consumption	To be reduced by 20 % by 2020 and 50 % by 2050 compared to 2008
7.2.a	Renewable energy <i>Strengthening a sustainable energy supply</i>	Share of renewable energy sources in gross final energy consumption	To be increased to 18 % by 2020, to 30 % by 2030 and 60 % by 2050

No.	Indicator field <i>Sustainability postulate</i>	Indicators	Targets
7.2.b		Share of renewable energy sources in gross electricity consumption	To be increased to at least 35 % by 2020, to at least 50 % by 2030 and to at least 80 % by 2050
SDG 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all			
8.1.	Resource conservation <i>Using resources economically and efficiently</i>	Total raw material productivity = (GDP+imports)/raw material input (RMI)	Trend of 2000–2010 to be maintained until 2030
8.2.a	Government debt <i>Consolidating public finances – creating intergenerational equity</i>	General government deficit	Ratio of government deficit to GDP less than 3 % To be maintained until 2030
8.2.b		Structural deficit	Structurally balanced public spending, total national structural deficit of no more than 0.5 % of GDP To be maintained until 2030
8.2.c		Government debt	Ratio of government debt to GDP no more than 60 % To be maintained until 2030
8.3	Provision for future economic stability <i>Creating favourable investment conditions – securing long-term prosperity</i>	Gross fixed capital formation in relation to GDP	Appropriate development of the ratio To be maintained until 2030
8.4	Economic output <i>Combining greater economic output with environmental and social responsibility</i>	Gross domestic product per capita	Steady and appropriate economic growth
8.5.a	Employment <i>Boosting employment levels</i>	Employment rate (total) (20- to 64-year-olds)	To be increased to 78 % by 2030
8.5.b		Employment rate (older people) (60- to 64-year-olds)	To be increased to 60 % by 2030
8.6	Global supply chains <i>Enabling decent work worldwide</i>	Number of members of the Textile Partnership	To be significantly increased by 2030
SDG 9. Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialisation and foster innovation			
9.1	Innovation <i>Shaping the future with new solutions</i>	Private and public spending on research and development	At least 3.5 % of GDP by 2025
SDG 10. Reduce inequality within and among countries			
10.1	Equal educational opportunities <i>Improving educational success of foreigners in German schools</i>	Foreign school graduates	Proportion of foreign school leavers with at least a Hauptschule certificate (lower secondary schooling) is to be increased, with their diploma rate to be raised to that of German school leavers by 2030

No.	Indicator field <i>Sustainability postulate</i>	Indicators	Targets
10.2	Distributive justice <i>Preventing excessive inequality within Germany</i>	Gini income coefficient after social transfers	Gini income coefficient after social transfers to be below the EU28 figure by 2030
SDG 11. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable			
11.1.a	Land use <i>Sustainable use of land</i>	Built-up area and transport infrastructure expansion	To be reduced to 30 ha minus x per day by 2030
11.1.b		Loss of open space in m ² /inhabitant	Reduction in the loss of open space per inhabitant
11.1.c		Inhabitants by area occupied by built-up areas and transport infrastructure (settlement density)	No reduction in settlement density
11.2.a	Mobility <i>Guaranteeing mobility – protecting the environment</i>	Final energy consumption in freight transport	Target range minus 15 to minus 20 % by 2030
11.2.b		Final energy consumption in passenger transport	Target range minus 15 to minus 20 % by 2030
11.2.c		Population-weighted average travel time with public transport from each stop to the next medium-sized/large city	Reduction
11.3	Housing <i>Affordable housing for all</i>	Housing cost overload	People overburdened by housing costs to be reduced to 13 % of the population by 2030
SDG 12. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns			
12.1.a	Sustainable consumption <i>Making consumption environmentally and socially compatible</i>	Market share of goods certified by independently verified sustainability labelling schemes (future prospect: market share of products and services with trustworthy and ambitious eco and social labels)	34 % by 2030
12.1.b		Energy consumption and CO ₂ emissions from consumption	Continuous reduction of energy consumption
12.2	Sustainable production <i>Increasing the proportion of sustainable production</i>	EMAS eco-management	5000 organisation locations by 2030
12.3.a	Sustainable procurement <i>Making the public sector a role model for sustainable public procurement</i>	Paper with Blue Angel certification as a proportion of the direct federal administration's total paper use	95 % by 2020
12.3.b		CO ₂ emissions of commercially available vehicles in the public sector	To be significantly reduced

No.	Indicator field <i>Sustainability postulate</i>	Indicators	Targets
SDG 13. Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts			
13.1.a	Climate protection <i>Reducing greenhouse gases</i>	Greenhouse gas emissions	To be reduced by at least 40 % by 2020, by at least 55 % by 2030, by at least 70 % by 2040 and by 80 % to 95 % by 2050, in each case compared to 1990
13.1.b	<i>Contribution to international climate protection funding</i>	International climate protection funding for the reduction of greenhouse gases and adaptation to climate change	Funding to be doubled by 2020 compared to 2014
SDG 14. Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development			
14.1.aa	Protecting the oceans <i>Protection and sustainable use of oceans and marine resources</i>	Nutrient inputs in coastal waters and marine waters – nitrogen input via the inflows into the Baltic	Adherence to the good conditions according to the Ordinance on the Protection of Surface Waters (annual averages for total nitrogen in rivers flowing into the Baltic shall not exceed 2.6 milligrams per litre)
14.1.ab		Nutrient inputs in coastal waters and marine waters – nitrogen input via the inflows into the North Sea	Adherence to the good conditions according to the Ordinance on the Protection of Surface Waters (annual averages for total nitrogen in rivers flowing into the North Sea shall not exceed 2.8 milligrams per litre)
14.1.b		Share of sustainably fished fish populations in the North Sea and Baltic	Fish stocks used for economic purposes to be sustainably managed in accordance with the MSY approach by 2020
SDG 15. Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss			
15.1	Species diversity <i>Conserving species – protecting habitats</i>	Species diversity and landscape quality	To be increased to the index value of 100 by 2030
15.2	Ecosystems <i>Protecting ecosystems, conserving ecosystem services and preserving</i>	Eutrophication of ecosystems	To be reduced by 35 % by 2030 compared to 2005
15.3	Forests <i>Preventing deforestation</i>	Payments to developing countries for the verified preservation or restoration of forests under the REDD+ rulebook	To be increased by 2030
SDG 16. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all, and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels			
16.1	Crime <i>Further increasing personal security</i>	Criminal offences	Number of recorded criminal offences per 100,000 inhabitants to be reduced to less than 7000 by 2030
16.2	Peace and security <i>Practical action to combat proliferation, especially of small arms</i>	Number of projects to secure, register and destroy small arms and light weapons carried out by Germany in affected regions of the world	At least 15 projects a year by 2030
16.3.a	Good governance <i>Tackling corruption</i>	Corruption Perception Index in Germany	To be improved by 2030

No.	Indicator field <i>Sustainability postulate</i>	Indicators	Targets
16.3.b		Corruption Perceptions Index in partner countries in the German development cooperation	To be improved by 2030
SDG 17. Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalise the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development			
17.1	Development cooperation <i>Supporting sustainable development</i>	Share of expenditure for official development assistance in gross national income	To be increased to 0.7 % of gross national income by 2030
17.2	Knowledge transfer, especially in technical areas <i>Sharing knowledge internationally</i>	Number of students and researchers from developing countries and LDCs per year (semester)	To be increased by 10 % by 2020, then stabilised
17.3	Opening markets <i>Improving trade opportunities for developing countries</i>	Share of imports from LDCs in total imports to Germany	To be increased by 100 % by 2030 (base value: 2014)

Coalition parliamentary group		Opposition parliamentary group
CDU/CSU SPD		AfD / FDP / The Left Party / Alliance 90/The Greens
(Name), Member of the Bundestag		(Name), Member of the Bundestag
Contact		Contact
(Name) (Extension) (Email)		(Name) (Extension) (Email)

U R G E N T – Bundesrat deadline: XX.XX.XXXX (DELETE IF APPROPRIATE)

Title	Please enter the title of the bill / ordinance here (copy and paste).
Lead responsibility	Lead Minister / lead committee

REVIEW RESULT	Coalition parliamentary group	Opposition parliamentary group
Recommendation	Please select one of the following: <input type="radio"/> Request for examination <input type="radio"/> No request for examination	Please select one of the following: <input type="radio"/> Request for examination <input type="radio"/> No request for examination
Reasons	<p>Briefly outline the reasons for or against a request for examination here. Examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The account given of the sustainability impact assessment is plausible. ○ The account given of the sustainability impact assessment is implausible, but the project nevertheless has a positive impact on sustainable development. ○ The account given of the sustainability impact assessment is implausible. It contains no statements (particularly) regarding the Principles of sustainable development, SDGs and/or Indicators mentioned below. ○ The matter relates to a law approving an international agreement. Even laws of this kind can contain provisions affecting sustainable development. They, too, are subject to the provisions on regulatory impact assessment (Rule 44 (1) of the Joint Rules of Procedure of the Federal Ministries). <p>Please note: If no agreement is reached, the spokespersons must be called in without delay, and the differing reasons should be entered here so that the note can be discussed by the spokespersons or at the Advisory Council meeting.</p> <p>CDU/CSU SPD: XXX AfD / FDP / The Left Party / Alliance 90/The Greens: XXX</p>	
Processing date	XX.XX.201X	XX.XX.201X

TEXT REVIEW	Coalition parliamentary group	Opposition parliamentary group
<p>Link to the German Sustainable Development Strategy according to the rapporteurs</p>	Yes / No / Partly	Yes / No / Partly
	<p>Enter the Principles of sustainable development, SDGs and Indicators from the list on pages 4 to 9, including the number, which have an impact on sustainable development in the opinion of the two rapporteurs.</p> <p>Further aspects of the Sustainable Development Strategy should also be listed, as the Principles of sustainable development, SDGs and Indicators are not exhaustive, but intended more as an aid.</p> <p>If no agreement is reached, see the “Reasons” section above.</p> <p>Principles of sustainable development: X, X, X</p> <p>SDGs: X, X, X</p> <p>Indicators: X, X, X</p>	
<p>What statements on sustainable development are made in the bill / ordinance?</p>	<p>Insert the statement from the project, which can be found <u>under the corresponding heading</u> in the Explanatory Memorandum of the bill / ordinance.</p>	
<p>Is this statement plausible?</p>	Yes / No	Yes / No
<p>If the statement is plausible, you need not complete the next four fields. Otherwise, please only indicate the numbers missing from the point of view of the rapporteurs and/or indicate what statement is additionally missing or would be desirable.</p> <p>The rapporteurs must agree; if not, see the “Reasons” section above.</p>		
<p>Principles of sustainable development not considered</p>		
<p>SDGs not considered</p>		
<p>Indicators not considered</p>		
<p>What further statements regarding the national impact on sustainable development are missing?</p>		
<p>Statement of facts (brief summary taken from the project):</p> <p>Copy and paste a brief summary of the project from the bill / ordinance (e.g. from the covering note or Explanatory Memorandum). It must be clear to third parties what will change as a result of the project, in particular whether it will have an impact on the Sustainable Development Strategy or other long-term consequences under Rule 44 (1) of the Joint Rules of Procedure of the Federal Ministries.</p>		